

Volume 111 ■ Issue 3 ■ July 2017

ISSN 0002-9300

AJIL

American Journal of International Law

INSIDE THIS ISSUE

- The Survival of the Secret Treaty: Publicity, Secrecy, and Legality in the International Order
Megan Donaldson
- What Works in Human Rights Institutions?
Katerina Linos and Tom Pegram
- Notes and Comments:
Unintended Positive Complementarity:
Why International Criminal Court
Investigations May Increase Domestic
Human Rights Prosecutions
Geoff Dancy and Florencia Montal



American Society
of International Law

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

Vol. 111

July 2017

No. 3

CONTENTS

PAGE

The Survival of the Secret Treaty: Publicity, Secrecy, and Legality in the International Order

Megan Donaldson 575

This article offers the first detailed history of the norm of treaty publication as it has evolved over the last century. Drawing on both public debates and archives of foreign ministries, it traces how, and why, secret treaties have persisted, even in liberal democracies. It challenges assumptions of ever-greater transparency over time, and complicates the associations made—by interwar reformers and international lawyers today—between the norm of treaty publication and ideals of legality in the international order.

What Works in Human Rights Institutions?

*Katerina Linos and
Tom Pegram* 628

Since 1993, the United Nations has promoted national human rights institutions (NHRIs); these have spread to almost 120 countries. We assess what makes NHRIs effective, using quantitative and qualitative methods. We find that formal institutional safeguards contribute greatly to NHRI efficacy even in authoritarian and transition regimes. Complaint-handling mandates are particularly useful because they help NHRIs build broad bases of support. Our findings show how international organizations can wield great influence with soft tools such as recommendations and peer-review mechanisms.

Notes and Comments

Unintended Positive Complementarity: Why International

Criminal Court Investigations May Increase

Domestic Human Rights Prosecutions *Geoff Dancy and Florencia Montal* 689

Correspondence

Anthony D'Amato 724

International Decisions

Edited by David P. Stewart

Maritime Delimitation in the Indian Ocean (Somalia v. Kenya) (Beatrice I. Bonafé) 725

International Court of Justice decision on interpretation of optional clause declarations that include a reservation for alternative methods of dispute settlement

<i>Council of the European Union v. Front Populaire</i> (Jed Odermatt)	731
Court of Justice of the European Union decision on application of an agreement to Western Sahara in light of the law of treaties and the principle of self-determination	
<i>African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights v. Libya</i> (Marie Joseph Ayissi)	738
African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights judgment on incommunicado detention and failure to provide access to counsel in time of political instability and insecurity	
<i>Urbaer v. Argentine Republic</i> (Tatiana Sainati and David Attanasio)	744
International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes award on application of international human rights principles to protections owing to foreign investors	
Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law	
<i>Edited by Kristina Daugirdas and Julian Davis Mortenson</i>	
Trump Administration Takes Steps to Implement Bilateral Agreement with Australia Regarding Refugees	752
Trump Administration Criticizes NATO Members for Failing to Meet Defense Spending Guideline; United States Joins Other NATO Members in Supporting Montenegro's Membership in the Organization	756
President Trump Issues Executive Orders Suspending Refugee Program and Barring Entry by Individuals from Specified Countries	764
Trump Administration Maintains Nuclear Deal with Iran, Despite Persistent Skepticism	776
United States Strikes Syrian Government Airbase in Response to Chemical Weapons Attacks by Syrian Forces; Two Additional Strikes on Syrian Government Forces Justified by Defense of Troops Rationale	781
United States Alleges Russia Continues to Violate INF Treaty	787
Recent Books on International Law	
Book Reviews	
Brooks, Rosa. <i>How Everything Became War and the Military Became Everything</i> (Deborah Pearlstein)	792
Koremenos, Barbara. <i>The Continent of International Law: Explaining Agreement Design</i> (Adam S. Chilton)	801
Scharf, Michael P. <i>Customary International Law in Times of Fundamental Change: Recognizing Grotian Moments</i> (Patrick Kelly)	805
Sarvarian, Arman, Filippo Fontanelli, Rudy Baker, and Vassilis Tzevelekos (eds.). <i>Procedural Fairness in International Courts and Tribunals</i> (Jessica Simonoff)	811
Orford, Anne and Florian Hoffman, with Martin Clark (eds.). <i>The Oxford Handbook of the Theory of International Law</i> (Donald Earl Childress III)	816
Fellmeth, Aaron Xavier. <i>Paradigms of International Human Rights Law</i> (Bart L. Smit Duijzentkunst)	819
Books Received	823
International Legal Materials, Contents, Vol. 56, No. 3	825

BOARD OF EDITORS

Editors in Chief

JOSÉ ENRIQUE ALVAREZ
New York University School of Law

BENEDICT KINGSBURY
New York University School of Law

DAPO AKANDE
Oxford University
KAREN J. ALTER
Northwestern University
ANTONY ANGHIE
National University of Singapore
EYAL BENVENISTI
Cambridge University
LAURENCE BOISSON DE CHAZOURNES
University of Geneva School of Law
CURTIS A. BRADLEY
Duke University School of Law
CHRISTOPHER BRUMMER
Georgetown University Law Center
BHUPINDER SINGH CHIMNI
Jawaharlal Nehru University
HARLAN COHEN
University of Georgia School of Law
GRÁINNE DE BÚRCA
New York University School of Law
JAMES THUO GATHII
Loyola University Chicago School of Law
TOM GINSBURG
University of Chicago Law School
JACK GOLDSMITH
Harvard Law School
MONICA HAKIMI
University of Michigan Law School

LAURENCE R. HELFER
Duke University Faculty of Law
ALEXANDRA HUNEEUS
University of Wisconsin Law School
KAREN KNOP
University of Toronto Faculty of Law
KATERINA LINOS
Univ. of California, Berkeley School of Law
DONALD M. McRAE
University of Ottawa Faculty of Law
CATHERINE POWELL
Fordham Law School
KAL RAUSTIALA
Univ. of California (UCLA) School of Law
NATALIE REID
Debevoise & Plimpton
HENRY J. RICHARDSON III
Temple University Beasley School of Law
ANNELISE RILES
Cornell Law School
ANTHEA ROBERTS
Australian National University
GREGORY SHAFFER
Univ. of California, Irvine School of Law
ALAN O. SYKES
Stanford Law School
INGRID WUERTH
Vanderbilt Law School

ex officio

LUCINDA LOW
MARK DAVID AGRAST
Honorary Editors

GEORGE H. ALDRICH
St. Michaels, Maryland
MAHNOUSH ARSANJANI
New Haven, Connecticut
RICHARD B. BILDER
University of Wisconsin Law School
CHARLES N. BROWER
The Hague, the Netherlands
EDITH BROWN WEISS
Georgetown University Law Center
THOMAS BUERGENTHAL
George Washington Univ. Law School
DAVID D. CARON
The Hague, the Netherlands
CHRISTINE M. CHINKIN
London School of Economics
JAMES R. CRAWFORD
The Hague, the Netherlands
JOHN R. CROOK
Potomac, Maryland
ANTHONY D'AMATO
Northwestern University School of Law
RICHARD FALK
University of California, Santa Barbara
TOM J. FARER
University of Denver
MICHAEL J. GLENNON
Fletcher School, Tufts University

ROSALYN HIGGINS
The Hague, the Netherlands
FREDERIC L. KIRGIS
Washington and Lee Univ. School of Law
CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN
Boston College Law School
DAVID A. MARTIN
University of Virginia School of Law
MICHAEL J. MATHESON
George Washington Univ. Law School
THEODOR MERON
The Hague, the Netherlands
JOHN NORTON MOORE
University of Virginia School of Law
BERNARD H. OXMAN
University of Miami School of Law
W. MICHAEL REISMAN
Yale Law School
STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL
South Woodstock, Vermont
DINAH SHELTON
George Washington Univ. Law School
DAVID P. STEWART
Georgetown University Law Center
PETER D. TROOBOFF
Covington & Burling LLP
RUTH WEDGWOOD
Johns Hopkins University

Senior Copyeditor
ERIN LOVALL

Cite-checker
CATHERINA VALENZUELA

Assistant to the Editors in Chief
RACHEL JONES

Submissions Editor 2016–17
NATHAN YAFFE

Associate Submissions Editors 2016–17
SEBASTIAN DUTZ
NAHUEL MAISLEY
CLAIRE SCHUPMANN

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The *American Journal of International Law (AJIL)* has been published quarterly since 1907. It features articles, editorials, notes, and comments by pre-eminent scholars on developments in international law and international relations. *AJIL* contains summaries and analyses of decisions by national and international courts and arbitral or other tribunals, and of contemporary U. S. practice in international law. Each issue lists recent publications in English and other languages, many of which are reviewed in depth. The *AJIL* is indispensable for all professionals working in international law, economics, trade, and foreign affairs.

It is the policy of the American Society of International Law not to take an official position, by resolution or otherwise, upon controversial questions. The views expressed in the articles, editorial comments, book reviews, and all other contributions to the *AJIL* are those of the individual authors and are not to be taken as representing the views of the Board of Editors or the Society.

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Society of International Law (ASIL) is a nonprofit, nonpartisan, educational membership organization founded in 1906 by U.S. Secretary of State Elihu Root and chartered by Congress in 1950. Headquartered in Washington, D.C., its mission is “to foster the study of international law and to promote the establishment and maintenance of international relations on the basis of law and justice.” ASIL holds Special Consultative Status with the Economic and Social Council of the United Nations and is a constituent society of the American Council of Learned Societies.

ASIL’s nearly four thousand members hail from more than one hundred nations with nearly 40 percent residing outside the United States. Its members include scholars, jurists, practitioners, government officials, leaders in international and nongovernmental organizations, students, and others interested in international law. Through its many publications, conferences, briefings, and educational events, ASIL seeks to serve the needs of its diverse membership and to advance understanding of international law among policymakers and the public.

ASIL is a volunteer-led organization governed by a sixty-member Executive Council elected by its membership. In partnership with the elected leadership, ASIL is led by an executive director and supported by a professional staff.

Become a member

asil.org/membership

Join one of the Society’s Partner Programs and receive complimentary ad space in *AJIL*

asil.org/financial-support/sponsors-and-institutional-supporters

Follow the Society on Twitter

twitter.com/asilorg

Like us on Facebook

facebook.com/AmericanSocietyofInternationalLaw

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COUNCIL OF THE SOCIETY, 2016–2017

<i>President</i>	LUCINDA A. LOW
<i>President-Elect</i>	SEAN D. MURPHY
<i>Honorary President</i>	ROSEMARY BARKETT
<i>Vice Presidents</i>	CATHERINE M. AMIRFAR, EDWARD KWAKWA, SEAN D. MURPHY, KAL RAUSTIALA
<i>Executive Vice President and Executive Director</i>	MARK DAVID AGRAST
<i>Secretary</i>	JAMES A. R. NAFZIGER
<i>Treasurer</i>	NANCY L. PERKINS
<i>Assistant Treasurer</i>	RONALD J. BETTAUER

Past Presidents: JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ, CHARLES N. BROWER, EDITH BROWN WEISS, DAVID D. CARON, JAMES H. CARTER, LORI FISLER DAMROSCH, DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN, LUCY REED, ARTHUR W. ROVINE, ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER, PETER D. TROOBOFF

Honorary Vice Presidents: LORI FISLER DAMROSCH, DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN, DAVID D. CARON

Council Members: STANIMIR A. ALEXANDROV, KAREN J. ALTER, ANGELA M. BANKS, R. DOAK BISHOP, ANNA SPAIN BRADLEY, TODD F. BUCHWALD, DONALD EARL CHILDRESS III, SARAH H. CLEVELAND, OLUFEMI ELIAS, SUSAN D. FRANCK, CHIARA GEORGETTI, DAWN YAMANE HEWETT, SANDRA L. HODGKINSON, DUNCAN B. HOLLIS, MEG KINNEAR, SAIRA MOHAMED, BLANCA MONTEJO, VINCENT O. NMEHIELLE, JIDE NZELIBE, JAYA RAMJI-NOGALES, DAVID L. SLOSS, BETH VAN SCHACK, CARLOS M. VÁZQUEZ, SAMUEL M. WITTEN

Councillors: DANIEL BETHLEHEM, JEFFREY L. BLEICH, HANNAH L. BUXBAUM, TAI-HENG CHENG, MARCELLA DAVID, JOAN E. DONOGHUE, JAMES T. GATHII, HAROLD HONGJU KOH, PETER MASON, ELISA MASSIMINO, M. MARGARET MCKEOWN, MARY MCLEOD, JOSEPH E. NEUHAUS, DANIEL M. PRICE, HÉLÈNE RUIZ-FABRI, LEILA NADYA SADAT, STEVEN M. SCHNEEBAUM, RICHARD H. STEINBERG, JANE E. STROMSETH, PETER TOMKA, JOEL P. TRACHTMAN, PAUL R. WILLIAMS, ADRIEN K. WING, NASSIB G. ZIADÉ

PHILANTHROPY AND THE SOCIETY

The ASIL accomplishes much of its work through charitable support. The Society is grateful to its many members who contribute to the annual fund and the endowment, the foundations whose grants fund special programs, and the law firms, publishers, universities, and others that sponsor ASIL activity. The Society is particularly honored to receive contributions through the 21st century campaign and Patrons program and to be included in our members' estate plans through the ASIL Heritage Circle. We recognize these contributors below.

21ST CENTURY CAMPAIGN

Leadership (\$1,000,000)

HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN*

Leadership (\$250,000)

CHARLES N. BROWER

Elihu Root Patron (\$50,000)

ANONYMOUS

DONALD K. ANTON

MAHNOUSH H. ARSANJANI AND W. MICHAEL REISMAN

GARY B. BORN

DAVID D. CARON AND SUSAN SPENCER

LORI FISLER DAMROSCH

DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN AND

JENNIFER LAKE

LUCINDA A. LOW AND

DANIEL B. MAGRAW

LUCY F. REED

ARTHUR W. ROVINE

Cordell Hull Patron (\$25,000)

R. DOAK BISHOP

JAMES H. CARTER

TAI-HENG CHENG

ELI WHITNEY DEBEVOISE II

JAMES LEITNER AND TRACY HIGGINS

ABBY COHEN SMUTNY

James Brown Scott Patron (\$15,000)

MARK DAVID AGRAS AND

DAVID M. HOLLIS

JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ AND SUSAN DAMPLO

CHARLES H. CAMP

DAVID COLSON

GLENN P. HENDRIX

O. THOMAS JOHNSON

JUDD KESSLER

BENEDICT KINGSBURY

CHARLOTTE KU

EDWARD KWAKWA

GABRIELLE KIRK McDONALD

SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY

JAMES A. R. NAFZIGER

JOSEPH E. NEUHAUS

MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL

DANIEL M. PRICE

ANDRÉS RIGO SUREDA

JUDGE BRUNO SIMMA

DON WALLACE JR.

PATRONS

Patrons of the Society have contributed \$10,000 or more to the Society. Patrons may also be recognized posthumously upon such a donation being made in their name.**

DOMINGO E. ACEVEDO

GERALD AKSEN

ARTHUR R. ALBRECHT

GEORGE H. ALDRICH

TEYMOUR A. ALIREZA

JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ AND

SUSAN DAMPLO

DIANE MARIE AMANN

CATHERINE M. AMIRFAR

JAMES G. APPLE

MAHNOUSH H. ARSANJANI

FRANK A. BAUMAN*

MRS. RICHARD BAXTER*

DAVID J. BEDERMAN* AND

LORRE B. CUZZE

DANIEL L. BETHLEHEM

RICHARD B. BILDER

R. DOAK BISHOP

ANDREA K. BJORKLUND

JOHN A. BOYD

JOHN BRISCOE

CHARLES N. BROWER

IAN BROWNLEE*

EDITH BROWN WEISS

LEE C. BUCHHEIT

THOMAS BURGENTHAL

WILLIAM J. BUTLER

SUSANA AND HUGO CAMINOS

CHARLES H. CAMP

DAVID D. CARON AND

SUSAN L. SPENCER

JAMES H. CARTER

DAVID A. COLSON

JAMES RICHARD CRAWFORD

JOHN R. CROOK

ANTHONY D'AMATO

LORI FISLER DAMROSCH AND JEAN

BAUER FISLER

ARTHUR H. DEAN*

ELI WHITNEY DEBEVOISE II

SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD*

TIMOTHY L. DICKINSON

DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN

AND JENNIFER LAKE

THOMAS A. DUBBS

EDWARD DUMBAULD*

RICHARD W. EDWARDS, JR.

ALONA E. EVANS*

BENJAMIN B. FERENCZ

DONALD FERENCZ

THOMAS M. FRANCK*

ALWYN V. FREEMAN*

JOHN KING GAMBLE

RONALD E. M. GOODMAN

CHRISTOPHER J. GREENWOOD

JOHN LAWRENCE HARGROVE

VICTORIA M. HARIRI*

OONA A. HATHAWAY

RITA E. HAUSER

JOHN N. HAZARD*

ALICE AND LOUIS* HENKIN

ROBERT E. HERZSTEIN

ROSALYN HIGGINS

KEITH HIGGET*

HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN*

CHARLES A. HUNNICUTT

JOHN H. JACKSON*

ANDREW J. JACOVIDES

MARK R. JOELSON

RICHARD A. JOHNSON

KENNETH I. JUSTER

SUSAN L. KARAMANIAN

EDWARD G. KEHOE

FREDERIC L. KIRGIS

CHARLOTTE KU

JEFFREY LANG

ELIHU LAUTERPACHT

ROY S. LEE

JEREMY I. AND

CANDACE C. LEVITT

CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN

MRS. RICHARD LILLICH

LUCINDA A. LOW AND

DANIEL B. MAGRAW

A. VAUGHAN LOWE

ANDREAS F. LOWENFELD*

HOUSTON PUTNAM LOWRY

BRUNSON MACCHESNEY*

ROBERT MACCRATE

RONALD ST. JOHN MACDONALD*

D. STEPHEN MATHIAS

STEPHEN C. MCCAFFREY

EDWARD WATSON MCWHINNEY*

ROBERT F. MEAGHER*

THEODOR MERON

HUSAM MESHAL

W. ROBERT MORGAN*

SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY

JAMES A. R. NAFZIGER

VED P. NANDA

ANDRE NEWBURG

MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL

SHIGERU ODA

BERNARD H. OXMAN

JAN PAULSSON

NANCY I. PERKINS

HERMAN PHLEGER*

B. DONOVAN PICARD

DANIEL M. PRICE

LUCY F. REED

W. MICHAEL REISMAN

SANG-MYON RHEE

ANDRÉS RIGO SUREDA

DAVIS R. ROBINSON

WILLIAM D. ROGERS*

ARTHUR W. ROVINE

SEYMOUR J. RUBIN*

PHILIPPE J. SANDS

OSCAR SCHACHTER*

STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL

MORTIMER N.S. SELLERS

ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER

ABBY COHEN SMUTNY

EARL A. SNYDER*

BARBARA STARK

ERIC STEIN*

CHARLES W. T. STEPHENSON

JOHN R. STEVENSON*

DAVID P. STEWART

LAURENCE STORCH

ENRIQUE P. SYQUIA

GENEVIEVE E. TILLAR*

PETER D. TROOBOFF

BETH VAN SCHAACK

DETLEV F. VAGTS*

CHARLES O. VERRILL, JR.

JILL MCCLANAHAN WATSON

RUTH WEDGWOOD

BURNS H. WESTON*

EDWIN D. WILLIAMSON

BASIL S. YANAKAKIS

ADRIEN K. WING

BRUCE ZAGARIS

NASSIB G. ZIADÉ

* deceased

** Since January 2012, Patron designation requires a contribution of \$15,000 or more.

THE ASIL HERITAGE CIRCLE

Members who include the ASIL in their estate plans and so notify the Society may join the ASIL Heritage Circle.

ANONYMOUS (2)

ELIZABETH ANDERSEN

JAMES G. APPLE

FRANK A. BAUMAN*

CHARLES N. BROWER

JAMES H. CARTER

SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD*

MICHAEL AND MARY ANN FARLEY

THOMAS M. FRANCK*

CHRISTIAN A. HERTER, JR.*

CHARLOTTE KU

CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN

H. C. L. MERRILL*

SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY

MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL

OSCAR SCHACHTER*

STEPHEN SCHER

ERIC STEIN*

JOHN R. STEVENSON*

GENEVIEVE EAGON TILLAR*

RICHARD YOUNG*

* granted posthumously

IN MEMORIAM

CHERIF BASSIOUNI

ARTHUR K. KUHN

HENRY C. MORRIS

JAMES BROWN SCOTT

STANLEY P. SMITH

More information about these and other ASIL philanthropic activities can be found at
www.asil.org/financialsupport.cfm.

JOURNAL INFORMATION

AJIL is published in print and digitally by Cambridge University Press on behalf of the American Society of International Law. The journal publishes quarterly, in January, April, July, and October, and to reduce time between acceptance and publication, contributions may appear online as *FirstView* publications in advance of their scheduled publication in an issue. Discover the entire *AJIL* back archive at cambridge.org/ajil/issues.

Subscriptions

The electronic version of *AJIL* is available to all members of the American Society of International Law by login to the ASIL website www.asil.org. Print copies are also supplied to all members.

To subscribe as a non-member or recommend a subscription to your librarian go to cambridge.org/ajil.

Submission of Manuscripts

AJIL invites submission of manuscripts on international law subjects. *AJIL*'s coverage extends beyond public international law to closely related issues of global governance, transnational law, and national or sub-state law. It generally does not publish manuscripts focused on purely private or commercial law or on comparative or foreign law, including the internal law of the European Union. *AJIL* will not consider submissions whose content has been, or will be, published before it appears in this journal.

AJIL welcomes submissions for **Lead Articles**, and shorter **Current Developments** and **Notes & Comments** pieces via *AJIL*'s electronic submission website mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ajil.

Editorial Comments are written by members of the Board of Editors. Content for the **Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law** section of *AJIL* is generated by the editors of that section and outside submissions are not accepted. The **Recent Books on International Law** section contains book reviews that are solicited by invitation of the editor, Richard Bilder. The **International Decisions** section, edited by Ingrid Wuerth, focuses on particularly significant decisions concerning important issues of (or developments in) international law. It consists of contributions that are mostly proposed to the editor by readers of the *AJIL*. Proposals for International Decisions should be sent to ingrid.wuerth@law.vanderbilt.edu.

AJIL Unbound, an online initiative to supplement *AJIL* by publishing short, original essays, periodically issues open calls for short contributions on specified topics.

AJIL is committed to publishing a diversity of authors, whether based in the United States or abroad, and to covering a wide range of subjects and approaches. Suggestions for topics for *AJIL* **symposia or Agora** should be sent to law.ajil.admin@nyu.edu.

**All submissions must follow the *AJIL* Style Guide. Full instructions on how to prepare
and submit your paper may be found here:**
cambridge.org/ajil/ifc

Claims and Address Updates

subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org (in the USA, Canada and Mexico)

journals@cambridge.org (elsewhere)

Copyright and Permissions

cambridge.org/about-us/rights-permissions.

To Advertise in the Journal

ad_sales@cambridge.org

Abstracting and Indexing Services

cambridge.org/ajil/abstracting

For other ASIL Publications

www.asil.org

Proper Citation

AJIL shall be cited according to the following example:

111 *AJIL* 219 (2017)

ISSN: 0002-9300

E-ISSN: 2161-7953

© American Society of International Law